

## The Kremlin Targets Ukraine Through Hungary

By Nataliya Bugayova with Franklin Holcomb

**Key Takeaway:** Russia has likely exploited recent tensions between Hungary and Ukraine to support its campaign to drive a wedge between Ukraine and its neighbors. The Kremlin has also revived its subversion in Western Ukraine focusing on minorities' autonomy issues. It is unlikely that the Kremlin intends to create an insurgency there as it did in Eastern Ukraine, but it may create another fissure that destabilizes Kyiv. The Kremlin is also likely to attempt to stoke tensions between Ukraine and its other neighbors with minorities in Western Ukraine, such as Poland. The U.S. must watch these trends, which are likely to be slow-burning and subtle. They have implications for Ukraine's stability and provide insight into Russia's evolving methods of irregular warfare.

## **Key Facts**

- Ukraine passed an educational bill that mandates the use of the Ukrainian language in schools on September 25.
- Nationalists in Hungary, which shares a border with Ukraine, condemned the bill for infringing upon the rights of 150,000 Hungarians in Western Ukraine's Zakharpatiya (Trans-Carpathia) region. Hungary's Russia-linked extreme nationalist<sup>1</sup> Jobbik party participated in a rally calling<sup>2</sup> for the self-determination of Zakharpatiya in Budapest on October 13.
- o The Hungarian government threatened to halt Ukraine's integration with the EU, though it received no support from key EU states. It also blocked<sup>3</sup> the next Ukraine-NATO Commission meeting<sup>4</sup> on October 27.
- O Hungarian Prime Minister Victor Orban also has a relatively strong relationship<sup>5</sup> with Russia. Hungary is the only EU country Russian President Vladimir Putin visited twice in 2017. The Kremlin also agreed<sup>6</sup> on a \$12 billion nuclear plant modernization project in Hungary planned for early 2018.
- Other Eastern European countries with ethnic communities in Ukraine criticized the bill but did not take as confrontational a stance as Hungary.<sup>7</sup>
- The Russian media launched a campaign to amplify this self-determination narrative, which it has propagated in the past, and criticize the Ukrainian law as "anti-European."
- o Although Ukraine and Hungary might have come to a compromise<sup>9</sup>, the Kremlin intervened and set conditions to exploit this vulnerability in the future.

The Kremlin has likely attempted to foster separatist narratives within Hungarian minorities in Western Ukraine for years.

Russia likely developed and leveraged its ties with a far-right Hungarian party, Jobbik, to propagate the idea of Zakharpatiya's autonomy. ISW assesses that the Kremlin supports Jobbik. The U.S. has reportedly been investigating¹º Russian funding of political parties in Europe, where Jobbik is a potential Kremlin target. A Jobbik Member of the European Parliament, Bela Kovacs, has been under investigation¹¹ by Hungarian authorities since 2014 over suspicions of working for Russian intelligence. Kovacs has had an office in Berehove, a key Ukrainian town with Hungarian minorities, since December 2010¹². Kovacs advocated¹³ for the creation of a special administrative district for Hungarian-speaking towns in Zakharpatiya as a necessary precondition to Ukraine's joining the EU Association Agreement in 2013. Jobbik members were among the observers in support of the illegitimate Russian referendum¹⁴ in Crimea¹⁵ in March 2015 and the illegal election held in the Russian proxy "Donetsk People's Republic" in



November 2014<sup>16</sup>. Jobbik members conducted a rally calling for self-determination<sup>17</sup> of Hungarians in Zakharpatiya in Budapest after the Russian occupation of Crimea in March 2014. Jobbik's leader, Gábor Vona, called<sup>18</sup> Russia the "Eurasian power that could spearhead a real…resistance against the Euro-Atlantic bloc."

- The Russian media created false narratives that dramatically overstated the aspirations of Hungarian minorities to gain autonomy. Two notable disinformation campaigns included reports<sup>19</sup> about the Ruthenes, another ethnic group in Zakharpatiya, holding a congress demanding their autonomy in March 2015. Another Russian media campaign<sup>20</sup> claimed that Rusyn and Hungarian communities of Zakharpatiya held a congress in Budapest, where they allegedly called for the federal status of their region in August of 2015. The respective communities' leaders have debunked both Russian narratives.
- The Kremlin likely attempted to build local organizations to use as a subversion tool. The Security Service of Ukraine (SBU) issued a warning<sup>21</sup> to the Zakarpatiya Regional Organization for the Protection of Workers Rights about its potential criminal liability for encroachment on the territorial integrity of Ukraine in July 2015. The organization, registered only one month earlier<sup>22</sup>, promoted the idea of a special self-governing territory for Hungarian minorities as being essential for ensuring workers' rights. Local investigative journalists soon exposed<sup>23</sup> the organization's connections to Russia, and the SBU's warning followed shortly thereafter.

## Russia may have exploited the recent tensions between Ukraine and Hungary to revive its subversion efforts on Ukraine's Western border.

- Obbik called for the autonomy of Hungarian minorities in Western Ukraine. Jobbik reportedly organized<sup>24</sup> a "Zakharpatiya self-determination" rally in Budapest on October 13, calling for the autonomy of the region. News reports showed some of the participants holding signs reading "Hungary wants Transcarpathia back!<sup>25</sup>" Jobbik renewed its push for a regular all-Hungarian roundtable<sup>26</sup> on the Transcarpathian issue on September 29. Jobbik promised to launch a significant "struggle<sup>27</sup> for the autonomy of Hungarian communities living abroad" within the context of its election campaign. Both Jobbik and Hungary's ruling nationalist Fidescz party are likely to use the issue of Hungarian minorities abroad to gain political capital ahead of Hungary's 2018 elections.
- The Kremlin launched a media operation to amplify Hungarian nationalist criticism of the Ukrainian educational bill.<sup>28</sup> The Hungarian Government threatened to ask the EU to revise its association agreement<sup>29</sup> with Ukraine, and strongly condemned the bill. Poland, Romania, and others with ethnic communities in Ukraine criticized the bill but did not further press their concerns. Polish officials stated on October 23 that they do not view the bill as a threat and that minority groups should be able to know both Ukrainian and Polish<sup>30</sup> languages. Ukrainian Foreign Minister Pavlo Klimkin stated that Ukraine and Hungary found a compromise<sup>31</sup> and will cooperate on the execution of the law on October 19. Nevertheless, the Hungarian government escalated by blocking<sup>32</sup> the next Ukraine-NATO commission meeting on October 27. Russian propaganda boosted the Hungarian nationalist narrative and continued to frame Ukraine as an oppressor of minorities, suggesting that Ukraine is about to lose additional territory<sup>33</sup> and push away its European<sup>34</sup> and NATO<sup>35</sup> partners.



o The Russian media campaign is also likely targeting Hungarian minorities in Ukraine to inflame ethnic tensions. The Russian media narratives warn of alleged Ukrainian repressions against ethnic Hungarians in Western Ukraine, which greatly resembles Russia's propaganda in Ukraine's Donbas region.<sup>36</sup>

The Kremlin is likely pursuing a broader campaign aimed at driving a wedge between Ukraine and its European<sup>37</sup> neighbors. Ukrainian authorities arrested a group of saboteurs on October 2 who were attempting to destroy a Hungarian monument in Zakharpatiya. Ukrainian Interior Minister Arsen Avakov stated the detained individuals were connected to the defunct pro-Russia Party of Regions in Ukraine. Avakov stated that the gang was responsible for at least eight other incidents intended to inflame tensions between Ukraine and EU in 2016-2017. Earlier in 2017, for example, protest participants claimed that Russia-backed elements paid them to instigate anti-Polish Ukrainian nationalist protests at the Polish embassy in Kyiv on July 7.<sup>38</sup>

## **Implications**

It is unlikely that Russia intends to or is able to create a Donbas-like insurgency in Zakharpatiya. This Western Ukrainian region has strong pro-Ukrainian sentiments, small minority communities, and other differentiating factors. However, sustained Russian subversion may create another destabilization problem for Kyiv to solve. Growing pre-election rhetoric from Hungarian nationalist parties about protecting Hungarians abroad has amplified the Kremlin's continued cultivation of minorities' self-determination and autonomy movements. The Kremlin's information operations in turn amplify Hungarian messaging. The cumulative effect may lead to more discussions about special status for the region and, potentially, to a referendum in the longer term. Kyiv's increased focus on its own 2019 elections and the continued war in Eastern Ukraine may prevent the Ukrainian government from allocating necessary resources to address underlying concerns in Zakharpativa and otherwise resisting Russia's subversion. The complexity of the situation may allow Russia to effectively conceal its hand and portray any escalation as indigenous confrontation between ethnic groups within Ukraine or Ukraine and its neighbor. Additional destabilization may stretch Kyiv's already thin resources and damage Ukraine's relations with its European partners, Finally, the Kremlin's reinforcement of regional self-determination narratives and the rhetoric about protecting minorities abroad among Eastern European states helps Russia legitimize its own expansionist actions, which it claims are motivated by its desire to "protect" Russian minorities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Intent on unsettling the EU, Russia Taps Soldiers from the Fringe," The New York Times, December 24, 2016. Available https://www(.)nytimes.com/2016/12/24/world/europe/intent-on-unsettling-eu-russia-taps-foot-soldiers-from-the-fringe.html,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Jobbik Party is the Organizer of Rally for Zakarpattia Self-Determination," 122 UA, October 12, 2017. Available https://112.international/politics/jobbik-party-is-organizer-of-rally-for-zakarpattia-self-determination-21600(.)html <sup>3</sup> "Hungary blocks Ukraine-NATO Commission meeting in December due to education law" UNIAN, October 27, 2017. Available https://www(.)unian.info/politics/2212494-hungary-blocks-ukraine-nato-commission-meeting-in-december-due-to-education-law.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Hungary cannot support Ukraine's integration aspirations" [Russian] Kormany, October 27, 2017. Available http://www.kormany.hu/hu/kulgazdasagi-es-kulugyminiszterium/hirek/magyarorszag-nem-tudja-tamogatni-ukrajna-integracios-torekveseit

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> "Why Putin need Orban," Politico EU, February 1, 2017. Available https://www(.)politico.eu/article/why-vladimir-putin-needs-viktor-orban-russia-hungary/; "Russia-Hungary relations continue developing – Medvedev" TASS, August 20, 2017. Available http://tass.com/politics/961091

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "Putin Tells Hungary's Orban Nuclear Plant Expansion To Start Next Year" Radio Free Europe Radio Liberty August 29, 2017. Available https://www(.)rferl.org/a/putin-hungary-orban-judo/28700669.html

<sup>7</sup> "Poland not to support Hungary's protest against Ukraine's education law." UNIAN October 20, 2017. Available https://www(.)unian.info/politics/2198011-poland-not-to-support-hungarys-protest-against-ukraines-education-law.html; "Waszczykowski critical of Putin visits Hungary" [Polish] Rzeczpospolita October 19, 2017 Available http://www(.)rp.pl/Dyplomacja/171018766-Waszczykowski-krytycznie-o-wizytach-Putina-na-Wegrzech.html <sup>8</sup> "Ukraine's law on education undercuts legal norms of any state, official says" TASS September 26, 2017 Available http://tass(.)com/politics/967613

<sup>9</sup> "Ukraine and Hungary will work together to implement the Law on Education" [Russian] Pravda, October 19, 2017 Available http://www(.)pravda.com.ua/rus/news/2017/10/19/7158982/; "Paruby - Venice Commission: The discussion about the Law on Education has more political than legal grounds" [Russian] Censor.net October 31, 2017. Available

https://censor.net.ua/news/461178/parubiyi\_venetsianskoyi\_komissii\_diskussiya\_vokrug\_zakona\_ob\_obrazovanii\_i meet\_bolshe\_politicheskie

<sup>10</sup> "Russia accused of clandestine funding of European parties as US conducts major review of Vladimir Putin's strategy" The Telegraph, January 16, 2016. Available

http://www.telegraph(.) co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/russia/12103602/America-to-investigate-Russian-meddling-in-EU.html

<sup>11</sup> Hungary: European Parliament Lifts Immunity for Spy Suspect," The New York Times, October 14, 2015. Available https://www.nytimes.com/2015/10/15/world/europe/hungary-european-parliament-lifts-immunity-for-spy-suspect.html; New Dimension of diplomatic Conflict between Ukraine and Hungary [Ukranian] Euromaidan Press October 18, 2017. Available http://euromaidanpress(.)com/2017/10/17/separatism-transcarpathian-style-is-hungary-aiming-to-grab-a-part-of-ukraine/#arvlbdata; "Is the Hungarian far-right Jobbik party financed by Russia?" Hungarian Spectrum January 20, 2017. Available http://hungarianspectrum(.)org/2016/01/20/is-the-hungarian-far-right-jobbik-party-financed-by-russia/

<sup>12</sup> "Hungary Intend to Legally Deprive Transcarpathia. Infographics," [Ukrainian] March 12, 2017. Available https://www(.)volynnews.com/news/policy/uhorshchyna-planuye-lehalno-vidibraty-zakarpattia-infohrafika/

<sup>13</sup> "Baile Kovacs states that Ukraine will not be in the EU without Prityansky district in Transcarpathia" [Ukrainian] Mukachevo.net October 19, 2013. Available http://www(.)mukachevo.net/ua/news/view/81604-Бейла-Ковач-заявляє-що-Україна-не-буде-в-ЄС-без-Притисянського-округу-на-Закарпатті-ФОТО

<sup>14</sup> "Jobbik: Crimea referendum is Exemplary" Jobbik March 18, 2014. Available http://www.jobbik.com/jobbik crimea referendum exemplary

<sup>15</sup> "The Kremlin Connections of the Hungarian Far-Right," Stratfor April 20, 2015. Available https://worldview(.)stratfor.com/the-hub/kremlin-connections-hungarian-far-right

<sup>16</sup> "Potemkin Observers" The Economist, November 4, 2014. Available

https://www(.economist.com/blogs/easternapproaches/2014/11/ukraines-rebels-and-eurosceptics

17 "Petition to the Government of Hungary for Transcarpathia," gaudinagytamas, April 3, 2014. Available http://gaudinagytamas(.)hu/petition\_government\_hungary\_transcarpathia; "The Kremlin Connections of the Hungarian Far-Right," Stratfor April 20, 2015. Available https://worldview(.)stratfor.com/the-hub/kremlin-connections-hungarian-far-right; New Dimension of diplomatic Conflict between Ukraine and Hungary [Ukranian] Euromaidan Press October 18, 2017. Available http://euromaidanpress(.)com/2017/10/17/separatism-transcarpathian-style-is-hungary-aiming-to-grab-a-part-of-ukraine/#arvlbdata; "Experts elaborate on nature of Hungary-Ukraine Tensions," Unian, October 17, 2017. Available; https://www.unian(.)info/politics/2190989-experts-elaborate-on-nature-of-hungary-ukraine-tensions.html; "Hankering for Transcarpathia? Hungary is attacking Ukraine," UKrop News, October 12, 2017 Available https://ukropnews24(.)com/hankering-for-transcarpathia-hungary-is-attacking-ukraine/

<sup>18</sup> "The Voice of Russia-Exclusive interview with Gabor Vona" Jobbik September 4, 2013. Available http://www(.)jobbik.com/voice\_russia\_-exclusive\_interview\_g%C3%A1bor\_vona

<sup>19</sup> "Long Live Ruthenia," The Economist, April 3, 2015. Available

http://www.economist.com/news/europe/21647828-russian-press-cooks-up-ethnic-separatism-transcarpathia-long-live-ruthenia; "Rusyns in Transcarpathia demand recognition of their nationality and autonomy edge through dialogue" [Russian] TASS March 14, 2015. Available http://tass.ru/mezhdunarodnaya-panorama/1828915 

20 "Carpatho-Rusyns Deny Reports on their struggle for their Region's Federal Status," StopFake, August 14, 2014. Available https://www.stopfake(.)org/en/carpatho-rusyns-refuted-information-about-their-struggle-for-the-federal-status-of-their-region/; "Information Hygiene: Who Spreads Rumors and Fake News" [Ukrainian] MediaSapiens, September 17, 2014. Available

 $http://osvita.mediasapiens.ua/ethics/manipulation/informatsiyna\_gigiena\_khto\_poshiryue\_chutki\_ta\_feyki/linearing/l$ 



http://zakarpattya(.)net.ua/News/141042-V-Uzhhorodi-pid-vyhliadom-zarobitchanskoi-orhanizatsii-zareiestruvaly-cherhovyi-kremlivsko-rusynskyi-proekt-DOKUMENTY-VIDEO "Transcarpathia in the context of threats to the territorial Integrity of Ukraine" [Ukrainian] Nbuviap 2015. Available.

http://nbuviap(.)gov.ua/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=1271:zakarpattya-2&catid=63&Itemid=393

<sup>23</sup> "Regular Kremlin-"Rusyn" project (DOCUMENTS) (VIDEO) was registered in Uzhhorod under the guise of "Zarobitchan" organization," [Ukrainian] Zakarpattya, June 10, 2015. Available

http://zakarpattya(.) net.ua/News/141042-V-Uzhhorodi-pid-vyhliadom-zarobitchanskoi-orhanizatsii-zareiestruvaly-cherhovyi-kremlivsko-rusynskyi-proekt-DOKUMENTY-VIDEO

<sup>24</sup> "Ukraine Crisis: Hands Off Transcarpathia!" Huffpost, 2014. Available

https://www(.)huffingtonpost.com/nikolas-kozloff/ukraine-crisis-hands-off\_b\_5358893.html; "I've lost my illusions about a united Europe, not hope," Kyiv Post, Oct 17, 2017. Available https://www.kyivpost.com/article/opinion/oped/veronika-melkozerova-ive-lost-illusions-united-europe-not-hope.html; "Jobbik Party is the Organizer of Rally for Zakarpattia Self-Determination," 122 UA, October 12, 2017. Available https://112.international/politics/jobbik-party-is-organizer-of-rally-for-zakarpattia-self-determination-21600(.)html; "Experts elaborate on nature of Hungary-Ukraine Tensions," Unian, October 17, 2017. Available; https://www.unian(.)info/politics/2190989-experts-elaborate-on-nature-of-hungary-ukraine-tensions.html;

<sup>25</sup> "Ukraine Crisis: Hands Off Transcarpathia!" Huffpost, 2014. Available

https://www(.)huffingtonpost.com/nikolas-kozloff/ukraine-crisis-hands-off\_b\_5358893.html; "Self-determination from the "bobby" and "great Hungary" from Orban. What is happening in Transcarpathia" [Russian] Ctpaha October 14, 2017. Available https://strana(.)ua/articles/analysis/98659-stanet-li-zakarpate-ukrainskoj-kataloniej.html 26 "Jobbik initiates all-Hungarian roundtable discussion on Transcarpathian situation" Jobbik, 2017. Available http://jobbik(.)com/jobbik\_initiates\_all\_hungarian\_roundtable\_discussion\_on\_transcarpathian\_situation 27 "Gábor Vona promises real struggle for autonomy after 2018" Jobbik 2017. Available http://www(.)jobbik.com/gabor\_vona\_promises\_real\_struggle\_for\_autonomy\_after\_2018; "Jobbik stands for Hungarians in Transylvania and Partium" Daily News Hungary, April 24, 2017. Available

https://dailynewshungary(.)com/jobbik-stands-hungarians-transylvania-partium/

<sup>28</sup> "No place for Ukraine in EU, Hungary says after Kiev outlaws education in minority languages" RT, September 26, 2017. Available https://www(.)rt.com/news/404683-hungary-outraged-ukraine-education/; "'Major impediment': PACE says Ukraine education law violates ethnic minority rights" RT October 12, 2017 Available https://www(.)rt.com/news/406519-pace-ukraine-education-law/

<sup>29</sup> "Hungary Steps up pressure on Ukraine over new education Law" Washington Post, October 10, 2017. Unavailable https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/europe/hungary-steps-up-pressure-on-ukraine-over-new-education-law/2017/10/10/473b0324-ad8d-11e7-9b93-b97043e57a22\_story.html?utm\_term=.1c2c74a82ff8 <sup>30</sup> "Poland not to support Hungary's protest against Ukraine's education law" UNIAN October 20, 2017. Available https://www(.)unian.info/politics/2198011-poland-not-to-support-hungarys-protest-against-ukraines-education-law.html, "Waszczykowski critical of Putin visits Hungary" [Polish] Rzeczpospolita October 19, 2017 Available http://www(.)rp.pl/Dyplomacja/171018766-Waszczykowski-krytycznie-o-wizytach-Putina-na-Wegrzech.html <sup>31</sup> "Ukraine and Hungary will work together to implement the Law on Education" [Russian] Pravda, October 19, 2017 Available http://www(.)pravda.com.ua/rus/news/2017/10/19/7158982/

<sup>32</sup> "Hungary blocks Ukraine-NATO Commission meeting in December due to education law" UNIAN, October 27, 2017. Available https://www(.)unian.info/politics/2212494-hungary-blocks-ukraine-nato-commission-meeting-in-december-due-to-education-law.html

<sup>33</sup> "From Hungary the Hungarian piece will fall off" [Russian] YTOP.py October 12, 2017. Available https://utro(.)ru/politics(/)2017/10/12/1342545.shtml

<sup>34</sup> ""Forget about the European future." Why Hungary became the enemy of Ukraine" AIF.ru September 26, 2017 Available

 $http://www(.)aif.ru/politics/world/zabudte\_o\_evropeyskom\_budushchem\_pochemu\_vengriya\_stala\_vragom\_ukrainv$ 

<sup>35</sup> "Not on My Watch: Hungary Vetoes NATO-Ukraine Summit" Sputnik October 29, 2017. Available https://(s)putniknews.com/europe/201710291058630471-hungary-vetoes-nato-ukraine-summit/



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> "In Transcarpathia, The SBU Announced the Closure of an Organization associated with the Separatist Gatsk," [Ukrainian] Tyzhden, July 28, 2015. Available http://mobile(.)tyzhden.ua/news/142108

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> "Regular Kremlin-"Rusyn" project (DOCUMENTS) (VIDEO) was registered in Uzhhorod under the guise of "Zarobitchan" organization," [Ukrainian] Zakarpattya, June 10, 2015. Available

<sup>37</sup> "In MVD tied series resonant crime audio band, whose members are detained (added)" [Russian] Donbass News October 2, 2017 Available http://novosti(.)dn.ua/news/274911-v-mvd-svyazaly-ryad-rezonansnykh-prestuplenyy-sodnoy-bandoy-uchastnyky-kotoroy-zaderzhany; "Ukraine busts gang plotting to blow up Hungarian monument in Zakarpattia to boost tensions UNIAN, October 2, 2017 Available https://www(.)unian.info/society/2165641-ukraine-busts-gang-plotting-to-blow-up-hungarian-monument-in-zakarpattia-to-boost-tensions.html"; "Avakov Said that the arrest of a groupof performers of nine resonant crimes" [Ukrainian] Ukrinform October 2, 2017. Available https://www(.)ukrinform.ua/rubric-society/2316491-avakov-zaaviv-pro-zatrimanna-grupi-vikonavciv-devati-rezonansnih-zlociniv.html; "Interior Ministry of Ukraine told about the arrest of the gang, "incited xenophobia"" [Belarusian] Radio Svaboda, October 2, 2017. Available https://www(.)svaboda.org/a/28769533.html <sup>38</sup> "Provocative rally at the Polish Consulate in Kiev was ordered by the secret services of Russia - Security [Ukrainian] УНІАН July 7, 2017, available: https://www.unian.ua/incidents/2017391-provokativna-aktsiya-bilya-konsulstva-polschi-v-kievi-bula-zamovlena-spetsslujbami-rf-sbu.html"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> "Fake: Ukraine Begins Repression of Hungarians in Transcarpathia" StopFake, May 25, 2017. Available https://www(.)stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-begins-repression-of-hungarians-in-transcarpathia/; Propaganda piece: "Hungarians create autonomy in Transcarpathia" [Russian] YTPO.py May 19, 2017 available https://utro(.)ru/articles/2017/05/19/1327600.shtml; Hungarian Community in Transcarpathia set a Stele in the Native Language [Russian] May 18, 2017 Available http://ru.golos(.)ua/uncategory/vengerskaya\_obschina\_zakarpatya\_ustanovila\_stelyi\_na\_rodnom\_yazyike\_video\_53